Measuring Bologna compliance in Institutions of Higher Education

Paul D. Ryan
paul.ryan@nuigalway.ie
Aims of the Bologna Process

- A European Higher Education Area by 2010
  - in which students could choose from a wide and transparent range of high quality courses and benefit from smooth recognition procedures.
  - more competitive and more attractive for Europeans and for students and scholars from other continents
  - Enable Europe to match the performance of the best performing systems in the world
Assessment of level of Compliance

- National
  - Bologna Steering Committee
  - Scorecards
- Professional
  - Tuning tools
  - Networks
  - Professional Associations
  - Regulators
- Institutional
  - Clearly defined
    - ECTS Label
    - Diploma Supplement Label
  - Less clearly defined
    - QA process
## National Scorecards

### Degree System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>NQF</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Regulation</th>
<th>Equivalency</th>
<th>Lisbon</th>
<th>ECTS</th>
<th>RPL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Access C2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% Green</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2 Cycles

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

### Students in External QA

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

### Internal QA

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

### Diploma Supp

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

### Lisbon Conv

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

### ECTS

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

### RPL

- 90% Green
- 80% Green
- 70% Green
- 60% Green
- 50% Green
- 40% Green
- 30% Green
- 20% Green
- 10% Green

---

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June '11
ECTS Label

- European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
- Credit system for higher education used in the European Higher Education Area
- 60 ECTS for 2 semester year (Cycles 1 + 2)
- Must pass (no agreed grading system)
- Label awarded for excellence in implementation
Diploma Supplement Label

- Label awarded for excellence in implementation
- Awarded with Local Certificate

- Holder
- Qualification
- Level of Qualification
- Contents and Results Gained
- Function of Qualification
- Certification
- National Higher Education System

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June '11
Labels

• Take up slow
  • http://ec.europa.eu/education/pub/pdf/higher/ectsds0910_en.pdf

• Perhaps easier for a smaller, centrally regulated IHE than a larger, more independent IHE with ‘professional’ Faculties??

• Only certify some aspects of Bologna aims (see Action Lines)
  – Can ‘Tuning’ help Institutions to monitor?

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June ’11
Bologna Action Lines

- Mobility
- Qualifications Frameworks / Three-Cycle System
- Recognition of Qualifications
- Quality Assurance
- European Higher Education in a Global Context
- Employability
- Social Dimension
- Lifelong Learning
- Joint Degrees
- Bologna Beyond 2010
- Stocktaking

"Who hasn't Azo on his side, will not go to court"

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June '11
Implementation

- Biannual Educational Ministers’ meeting
  - Bologna (1999)
  - Prague (2001)
  - Bergen (2005)
  - London (May 2007)
  - Leuven/Louvain-La-Neuve (April 2009)
  - Budapest-Vienna (March 2010)
  - Bucharest (April 2012)

Bologna University

- Measure progress and
- Set priorities for action.
Factors affecting Institutional compliance

• National
  – e.g. NQF
  – Funding?

• Regulated Professions
  – National and European Regulations
  – Tuning has experience (Nursing, Engineers etc.)

• Those controlled by the IHE itself?
Global adoption of the 3 Cycle System

- Proportion of graduates outside the Bologna Structure
- PhDs and Doctorates
- Long first degrees
- Masters’ Degrees
- Bachelors’ Degrees
- Short Cycle Degrees

Source:
‘OECD Education at a Glance 2010’
Table A.3.3
Mobility

"Mobility of staff, students and graduates is one of the core elements of the Bologna Process, creating opportunities for personal growth, developing international cooperation between individuals and institutions, enhancing the quality of higher education and research, and giving substance to the European dimension".


Tuning Academy, Groningen, June '11
National Qualifications Framework

- NQFs
  - Map National Qualifications
  - Levels
  - Concepts used
    - Knowledge
    - Competencies
    - Outcomes
    - Workload

Source: NQAI (2009)
Quality Assurance

- Assurance of quality in higher education is:
  - a process of establishing stakeholder confidence that provision (input, process and outcomes) fulfils expectations or measures up to threshold minimum requirements. (Harvey 2009)

- ENQA Guide
  - ‘consumer protection’
  - the provision of advice and guidance in pursuit of improvements in the standards and quality of programmes of study and associated qualifications
Not just Quality Assurance (QA)

- Quality Assurance
  - 'Fitness for purpose'

- Quality of Graduate
  - Academic grades
  - Institution/programme attended
  - How validated?

- Quality Enhancement
  - All stakeholders within sector working together to improve 'threshold minimum'
European Higher Education in a Global Context

- Improving information on the European Higher Education Area (E.G. Ranking Strategy),
- Promoting European Higher Education to enhance its world-wide attractiveness and competitiveness,
- Intensifying policy dialogue,
- Strengthening cooperation based on partnership
- Furthering the recognition of qualifications.
Employability

- London (2007) Themes include:
  - Awareness-raising among employers of the value of a bachelors qualification and associated learning outcomes;
  - Involving employers in devising curricula and curriculum innovation based on learning outcomes;
  - Recognition of degrees in the labour market across Europe;
  - The role of higher education in lifelong learning and continuing professional development.
Social Dimension

- Higher education should play a strong role in fostering social cohesion, reducing inequalities and raising the level of knowledge, skills and competences in society. Policy should therefore aim to maximize the potential of individuals in terms of their personal development and their contribution to a sustainable and democratic knowledge-based society.
Lifelong Learning

- Lifelong learning strategies are necessary to face the challenges of competitiveness and the use of new technologies, and to improve social cohesion, equal opportunities and quality of life.

  - Improving RPL;
  - More flexible, student-centred modes of delivery;
  - Wider access to higher education.
  - NQFs support lifelong learning.

Giorgione, 3 ages, c.1510
Recognition of Prior Learning

- Recognition of prior learning (RPL) is the generic term used to describe the system for awarding or transferring credit to students on the basis of demonstrated learning that has occurred prior to admission.

- RPL can lead to:
  - Entry to a programme
  - Credit towards an exemption
  - Eligibility for a full award
Joint Degrees

- Programmes developed or approved jointly by partner institutes of higher education - PIHEs
- students from each PIHE spend significant part of the programme at other PIHEs;
- periods of study and exams passed are recognised by all PIHEs and countries;
- teaching staff from each PIHE act jointly
- degree awarded jointly by PIHEs, and fully recognised in all countries.
Research

- **1999: 6th AIM:** Promotion of the necessary European dimensions in higher education, particularly with regards to curricular development, inter-institutional cooperation, mobility schemes and integrated programmes of study, training and research.

- Research not in 2010 action lines
- Synergies with European Research Area
- Research into Teaching, Learning and Assessment not valued (low impact factor)
- Research informs Teaching
Bologna beyond 2010

- The proper and full implementation of the agreed Bologna principles and action lines across the EHEA, especially at the national and institutional levels
- Develop additional working methods, such as peer learning, study visits etc.
- Develop, enhance and strengthen the EHEA and taking further the synergies with the European Research Area,
Institutional Stocktaking
“Ultimately, we need to measure ourselves by how well we are serving our students. The mobility of graduates, scholars, and researchers is key to the whole process of building a better European higher education sector and a more cohesive Europe. To achieve the Bologna objectives requires effective national and European quality assurance arrangements that support accountability, protect the public interest and enable institutions to monitor their performance and improve.”

Batt O'Keeffe T.D., Minister for Education, Cork, 12th May 2008
• > 17,000 students
• 2,200 staff
• 5 National Research Centres
• Summer Schools
• Postgraduates (Cycles 2 and 3) in all Faculties
• Faculties:
  – Acadahm (University’s special mission to Irish Language);
  – Arts (+ Education + Performance);
  – Business + Law;
  – Engineering + Information Technology;
  – Medicine (+ Nursing and Social Science);
  – Science.
NUI Galway Survey (2009)
Methodology

• A questionnaire based on the London (2007) Action Lines
• 54 questions based on all 10 Action Lines
• A ‘traffic lights’ grading scheme used

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fully compliant</th>
<th>Compliant by given date</th>
<th>Plans for compliancy in early stages</th>
<th>Not compliant</th>
<th>Probably not relevant at School level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June ’11
NUI Galway Survey (2009)
Who?

• 31 Personal interviews (July – October ‘09)
  – Academics
    – All Heads of School, all Deans of Faculties
  – Management
    – Academic Secretary
    – Postgraduate Deans
    – International Office
    – Human Resources
    – Centre for Excellence in Teaching and Learning
    – Adult and Continuing Education
    – Quality Office
    – Recognition of Prior Learning/Access, Careers
  – Students
    – Student Education Officer
### How?

- Excel based
- Sheets per School were subjectively merged into summary sheets for that Faculty
- Detailed report covering performance under all 10 action lines circulated to Committee of Deans
- Full verbal debrief
## Mobility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial incentives</th>
<th>Is there any financial assistance to assist or encourage mobility for members of the University?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assistance with visas, work permits, residence</td>
<td>Does the University provide assistance for both incoming and outgoing staff and, or students with practical and legal matters?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pension arrangements</td>
<td>Do mobile staff members still benefit from pension benefits for the period of residence abroad?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate information and support available on a website</td>
<td>Is there sufficient information available on your School/College/University website to support and promote mobility?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June ’11
## Employability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusion of work related generic competences in curricula?</th>
<th>Do Courses/Modules in your School/College explicitly contain work related generic competences which are assessed and awarded academic credits?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion of work related specific competences in curricula</td>
<td>Do Courses/Modules in your School/College explicitly contain work related specific competences which are assessed and awarded academic credits?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of a career advice</td>
<td>Do staff of your School/College offer informal career advice to students?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuing personal development programme</td>
<td>Does your School/College offer courses that would be suitable for an individual's continuing personal development programme?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June '11
## Social Dimension

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Access to HE available to wider community</th>
<th>Does your College/School have an active policy to promote access to Higher Education for the wider community?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Outreach activities</td>
<td>Does your College/School engage in outreach activities in the wider community?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal development of individuals (staff)</td>
<td>Does your College/School actively participate in personal development schemes for staff?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability/Special Needs</td>
<td>Does your College/School actively engage in assisting students with disabilities or special needs?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June ’11
Results of Stocktaking

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June '11
Some consequences

• ‘Politically’ beneficial (*jump before pushed*)
• Joint Degrees now being implemented
• Highlighted that some of the professional areas needed more work between Universities and regulatory bodies
• Showed that there was widespread appreciation of what was required, however
  – Administration and Students seemed less well briefed
  – Management well briefed
• Useful in preparing for QA
• Highlighted areas of ‘best practice’ that could be developed in other subject areas.
Documents Consulted:

- Bologna work programme 2007-2009 (consolidated version of 02/03/2008)
- London Communiqué 18th May 2007,
- Towards the European Higher Education Area: responding to challenges in a globalised world
- Guidelines for Quality Enhancement in European Joint Master Programmes. Standards and
- Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area
- REFLEX - The Flexible Professional in the Knowledge Society: General Results of the REFLEX Project. Editors: Jim Allen and Rolf van der Velden
- The Leuven Communiqué
- The ECTS User Guide 2009
- OECD Education at a Glance 2010
- http://www.europass.ie/europass/
- http://www.education.ie/
- http://www.qualificationsrecognition.ie/

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June ’11
Thank you

Fig. 168—Free Distribution of Bread, Meat, and Wine to the People—Reduced Copy of a Woodcut of the Solemn Entry of Charles V and Pope Clement VII into Bologna, in 1530.

Woodcut showing free distribution of bread, meat and wine to mark the Solemn Entry of Charles V and Pope Clementine VII into Bologna 1530.

Tuning Academy, Groningen, June ’11